MAKING
EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

DEVELOPING CORE PROFICIENCIES
ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS / LITERACY UNIT

GRADE 9

"Apology"
Plato

ODELL EDUCATION
www.odelleducation.com

CC BY NC

DEVELOPING CORE PROFICIENCIES SERIES

This unit is part of the Odell Education Literacy Instruction: Developing Core Proficiencies program, an integrated set of ELA units spanning grades 6-12. Funded by USNY Regents Research Fund, the program (under development) is comprised of a series of four 3-week units at each grade level that provide direct instruction on a set of literacy proficiencies at the heart of the CCSS.

Unit I: Reading Closely for Textual Details
Unit II: Making Evidence-Based Claims
Unit III: Researching to Deepen Understanding
Unit IV: Building Evidence-Based Arguments

The Core Proficiencies units have been designed to be used in a variety of ways. They can be taught as short stand-alone units to introduce or develop key student proficiencies. Teachers can also integrate them into larger modules that build up to and around these proficiencies. Teachers can also apply the activity sequences and unit materials to different texts and topics. The materials have been intentionally designed for easy adaptation to new texts.

Unit materials available at
www.odelleducation.com/resources

MAKING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

Making evidence-based claims about texts is a core literacy and critical thinking proficiency that lies at the heart of the CCSS. The skill consists of two parts. The first part is the ability to extract detailed information from texts and grasp how it is conveyed. Education and personal growth require real exposure to new information from a variety of media. Instruction should push students beyond general thematic understanding of texts into deep engagement with textual content and authorial craft.

The second half of the skill is the ability to make valid claims about the new information thus gleaned. This involves developing the capacity to analyze texts, connecting information in literal, inferential, and sometimes novel ways. Instruction should lead students to do more than simply restate the information they take in through close reading. Students should come to see themselves as creators of meaning as they engage with texts.

It is essential that students understand the importance and purpose of making evidence-based claims, which are at the center of many fields of study and productive civic life. We must help students become invested in developing their ability to explore the meaning of texts. Part of instruction should focus on teaching students how to understand and talk about their skills.

It is also important that students view claims as their own. They should see their interaction with texts as a personal investment in their learning. They are not simply reading texts to report information expected by their teachers, but should approach texts with their own authority and confidence to support their analysis

This unit is designed to cultivate in students the ability to make evidence-based claims about texts. Students perform a sequence of activities centered on a close reading of text throughout the unit.

CC BY-NC

HOW THIS UNIT IS STRUCTURED

The unit activities are organized into five parts, each associated with sequential portions of text. The parts build on each other and can each span a range of instructional time depending on scheduling and student ability.

The unit intentionally separates the development of critical reading skills from their full expression in writing. A sequence of worksheets isolates and supports the progressive development of the critical reading skills. Parts 1-2 focus on making evidence-based claims as readers. Part 3 focuses on preparing to express evidence-based claims by organizing evidence and thinking. Parts 4 and 5 focus on expressing evidence-based claims in writing.

This organization is designed to strengthen the precision of instruction and assessment, as well as to give teachers flexibility in their use of the unit.

The first activities of Parts 2-5 – which involve independently reading sections of the text – are designed as independent reading assignments. If scheduling and student ability do not support independent reading outside of class, these activities can be done in class at the beginning of each Part. Accordingly, they are listed both as an independent reading activity at the end of each part and as an activity beginning the sequence of the next part.

Alternate configurations of Part 5 are given in the detailed unit plan to provide multiple ways of structuring a summative assessment.

HOW THIS UNIT ALIGNS WITH CCSS FOR ELA/LITERACY

The primary CCSS alignment of the unit instruction is with **RI.1** and **W.9b** (*cite evidence to support analysis of explicit and inferential textual meaning*).

The evidence-based analysis of the text, including the text-dependent questions and the focus of the claims, involve **RI.2** and **RI.3** (*determine a central idea and analyze how it is conveyed and elaborated with details over the course of a text*).

The numerous paired activities and structured class discussions develop **SL.1** (*engage effectively in a range of collaborative discussions building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly*).

The evidence-based writing pieces involve **W.4** (*produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience).*

CC BY-NC

HOW THIS UNIT ASSESSES STUDENT LEARNING

The unit's primary instructional focus is on making evidence-based claims as readers and writers. Parts 1-3 develop the reading skill. Activities are sequenced to build the skill from the ground up. A series of worksheets supports students in their progressive development of the skill. These worksheets structure and capture students' critical thinking at each developmental stage and are the primary method of formative assessment. They are specifically designed to give teachers the ability to assess student development of the reading skill without the influence of their writing abilities.

From the first activity on, students are introduced to and then use a set of criteria that describes the characteristics of an evidence-based claim. In pair work and class discussions, students use the first five of these criteria to discuss and evaluate evidence-based claims made by the teacher and their peers. Teachers use these same criteria to assess student claims presented on the worksheets from Parts 1-3.

As the instructional focus shifts to writing in Parts 4 and 5 so does the nature of the assessment. In these parts, teachers assess the student writing pieces. Students continue using worksheets as well, giving teachers clear and distinct evidence of both their reading and writing skills for evaluation. In Parts 4-5, students learn about and use six additional criteria for writing claims. Teachers apply these criteria in the formative assessment of students' written work, as well as the evaluation of their final evidence-based writing pieces.

In addition to reading and writing, the unit incorporates many structured collaborative activities to develop key speaking and listening proficiencies. Students and teachers use the Text-Centered Discussion Checklist to structure and evaluate participation in those discussions. Opportunities are also given for teachers to directly observe and evaluate student speaking and listening skills using the checklist.

Part 5 can be configured in multiple ways giving teachers the flexibility to structure a summative assessment suitable for their students.

CC BY-NC

HOW THIS UNIT TEACHES VOCABULARY

This unit draws on several strategies for teaching academic and disciplinary vocabulary. The primary strategy is the way critical disciplinary vocabulary and concepts are built into the instruction. Students are taught words like "claim," "evidence," "reasoning," and "inference" through their explicit use in the activities. Students come to understand and use these words as they think about and evaluate their textual analysis and that of their peers.
The EBC Checklist plays a key role in this process. By the end of the unit, students will have developed deep conceptual knowledge of key vocabulary that they can transfer to a variety of academic and public contexts.
The texts and activities also provide many opportunities for text-based academic vocabulary instruction. Many activities focus directly on analyzing the way authors use language and key words to develop ideas and achieve specific purposes. The process of developing and evaluating claims supports the acquisition of these words and content knowledge.

The texts are formatted with integrated tools for vocabulary development. Each page includes editable glossaries where teachers and students can choose various words to define. Some words have been pre-selected and glossed. Teachers may choose to differentiate vocabulary support by student.

HOW THIS UNIT MIGHT BE EMBEDDED IN CONTENT-BASED CURRICULUM

The unit is explicitly and intentionally framed as *skills-based instruction*. It is critical for students to understand that they are developing core literacy proficiencies that will enrich their academic and civic lives. The unit and activities should be framed for them as such. Nonetheless, the texts have been chosen, in part, for their rich content and cultural significance. They contain many important historical and contemporary ideas and themes. Moreover, they have been selected to connect with topics and events typically addressed in the grade's social studies classrooms. Teachers are encouraged to sequence the unit strategically within their curriculum and instructional plans, and to establish content connections that will be meaningful for students.

This might involve connecting the unit to the study of topics or eras in social studies, related genres or voices in literature, or themes and guiding questions.

Teachers can also adapt the unit activities and materials to other fiction and non-fiction texts. The materials have been intentionally designed for easy adaptation to a variety of texts.

Whatever the curricular context established by the teacher, the central emphasis of the unit should, however, be on evidence-based, text-focused instruction.

CC BY-NC

HOW TO USE THESE MATERIALS

This unit is in the format of a **Compressed File**. Files are organized so you can easily browse through the materials and find everything you need to print or e-mail for each day.

The materials are organized into three folders:

UNIT PLAN AND TEXTS

- Unit Plan
- Models
- Text(s)

The ***model claims and worksheets*** are meant only to illustrate the process, NOT to shape textual analysis. ***It is essential that both teachers and students develop claims based on their own analysis and class discussion***. Teachers are encouraged to develop their own claims in the blank worksheets to use with students when modeling the process.

TEXTS are formatted with spacing and margins to support ***teacher and student annotation***. Students should be encouraged to mark up their texts (electronically or in print) as they search for details. ***Paragraphs and lines are numbered*** for referencing in writing and discussion. ***Editable glossaries*** are at the bottom of each page. While some words have already been bolded and glossed, teachers are encouraged to use the editable features for choosing words they wish to focus on or gloss, and to differentiate vocabulary support for their students.

HANDOUTS

- Forming Evidence-Based Claims Handout
- Writing Evidence-Based Claims Handout
- Evidence-Based Claims Criteria Checklists I and II
- Evidence-Based Writing Rubric
- Text-Centered Discussion Checklist

WORKSHEETS

- Forming Evidence-Based Claims Worksheet
- Making Evidence-Based Claims Worksheet
- Organizing Evidence-Based Claims Worksheet
- Written Evidence-Based Claim Worksheet

WORKSHEETS and **CHECKLISTS** have been created as ***editable PDF forms.*** With the free version of Adobe Reader, students and teachers are able to type in them and save their work for recording and e-mailing. This allows students and teachers to work either with paper and pencil or electronically according to their strengths and needs. It also allows teachers to collect and organize student work for evaluation and formative assessment.

If you decide to **PRINT** materials, please note that you can print them at ***actual size***, without enabling the auto-fit function. All materials can be printed either in color or in black and white.

BY-NC

UNIT OUTLINE

PART 1: UNDERSTANDING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

- The teacher presents the purpose of the unit and explains the skill of making EBCs.
- Students independently read part of the text with a text-dependent question to guide them.
- Students follow along as they listen to the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.
- The teacher models a critical reading and thinking process for forming EBCs about texts.

PART 2: MAKING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

- Students independently read part of the text and look for evidence to support a claim made by the teacher.
- Students follow along as they listen to the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.
- In pairs, students look for evidence to support claims made by the teacher.
- The class discusses evidence in support of claims found by student pairs.
- In pairs, students make an EBC of their own and present it to the class.

PART 3: ORGANIZING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

- Students independently read part of the text and make an EBC.
- Students follow along as they listen to part of the text being read aloud.
- The teacher models organizing evidence to develop and explain claims using student EBCs.
- In pairs, students develop a claim with multiple points and organize supporting evidence.
- The class discusses the EBCs developed by student pairs.

PART 4: WRITING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

- Students independently review the text and develop an EBC.
- The teacher introduces and models writing EBCs using a claim from Part 3.
- In pairs, students write EBCs using one of their claims from Part 3.
- The class discusses the written EBCs of volunteer student pairs.
- The class discusses their new EBCs and students read aloud portions of the text.
- Students independently write EBCs.

PART 5: DEVELOPING EVIDENCE-BASED WRITING

- Students review the entire text and make a new EBC.
- The teacher analyzes volunteer student evidence-based writing from Part 4 and discusses developing global EBCs.
- Students discuss their new claims in pairs and then with the class.
- Students independently write a final evidence-based writing piece.
- The class discusses final evidence-based writing pieces of student volunteers.

CC BY-NC

PART 1

UNDERSTANDING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

"Begin at the Beginning"

OBJECTIVE:	Students learn the importance and elements of making evidence-based claims through a close reading of part of the text.

ESTIMATED TIME: 2-3 days

MATERIALS:
Forming EBC Handout
Forming EBC Worksheet
EBC Criteria Checklist I
Making EBC Worksheet

ACTIVITIES

1- INTRODUCTION TO UNIT
The teacher presents the purpose of the unit and explains the proficiency of making EBCs.

2- INDEPENDENT READING
Students independently read part of the text with a text-dependent question to guide them.

3- READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION
Students follow along as they listen to the text being read aloud, and the teacher leads a discussion guided by a series of text-dependent questions.

4- MODEL FORMING EBCs
The teacher models a critical reading and thinking process for forming EBCs about texts.

ALIGNMENT TO CCSS

TARGETED STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.1
RI.9-10.1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

SUPPORTING STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.2 RI.9-10.3 SL.9-10.1

RI.9-10.2: Determine a central idea of a text and analyze its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.
RI.9-10.3: Analyze how the author unfolds an analysis or series of ideas or events, including the order in which the points are made, how they are introduced and developed, and the connections that are drawn between them.
SL.9-10.1: Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9-10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 1: INTRODUCTION TO UNIT

The teacher presents the purpose of the unit and explains the proficiency of making evidence-based claims, making reference to the first five criteria from the EBC Checklist I.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Introduce the central purpose of the unit and the idea of a "claim" someone might make. The following is a possible approach:

Introduce the first characteristic of an evidence-based claim: "States a conclusion you have come to… and that you want others to think about." Pick a subject that is familiar to students, such as "school lunches" and ask them to brainstorm some claim statements they might make about the subject. Introduce the fourth characteristic: "All parts of the claim are supported by specific evidence you can point to" and distinguish claims that can be supported by evidence from those that are unsupported opinions, using the students' brainstorm list as a reference.

Move from experience-based claims to claims in a field like science. Start with more familiar, fact-based claims (For example, the claim "It is cold outside" is supported by evidence like "The outside thermometer reads 13 degrees F" but is not supported with statements like "It feels that way to me"). Then discuss a claim such as "Smoking has been shown to be hazardous to your health" and talk about how this claim was once considered to be an opinion, until a weight of scientific evidence over time led us to accept this claim as fact. Introduce the third characteristic/criterion: "Demonstrates knowledge of and sound thinking about a topic" and with it the idea that a claim becomes stronger as we expand our knowledge about a subject and find more and better evidence to support the claim.

Move from scientific claims to claims that are based in text that has been read closely. Use an example of a text read recently in class or one students are likely to be familiar with. Highlight that textual claims can start as statements about what a text tells us directly (literal comprehension) such as "Tom Sawyer gets the other boys to paint the fence" and then move to simple conclusions we draw from thinking about the text, like: "Tom Sawyer is a clever boy" because (evidence) "He tricks the other boys into doing his work and painting the fence." Then explain how text-based claims can also be more complex and require more evidence (e.g., "Mark Twain presents Tom Sawyer as a 'good bad boy' who tricks others and gets into trouble but also stands up for his friend Jim."), sometimes – as in this example – requiring evidence from more than one text or sections of text.

Explain that the class will be practicing the skill of making evidence-based claims that are based in the words, sentences, and ideas of a text by closely reading and analyzing the text (or texts) selected for this unit.

In the activities that follow, students will learn to make a text-based claim by moving from literal understanding of its details, to simple supported conclusions or inferences, to claims that arise from and are supported by close examination of textual evidence. This inductive process mirrors what effective readers do and is intended to help students develop a method for moving from comprehension to claim. In addition, the guiding questions, model claims, and movement through the text over the course of the unit are sequenced to transition students from an initial, literal understanding of textual details to:

- Claims about fairly concrete ideas presented in short sections of the text;
- Claims about more abstract ideas implied across sections of the text;
- More global claims about the entire text and its meaning.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 2: INDEPENDENT READING

Students independently read part of the text with a text-dependent question to guide them.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Students independently read the first two paragraphs of the Apology text and answer a text-dependent question: What is Socrates being accused of?
Briefly introduce students to the text. The introduction should be kept to naming the author, the book and the year of publication. You might also read the introductory lines at the beginning of the text to make sure students understand the context of Socrates' apology.

Students should be allowed to approach the text freshly and to make their own inferences based on textual content. Plenty of instruction and support will follow to ensure comprehension for all students. The question helps orient students to the text and begins the focus on searching for textual evidence.

ACTIVITY 3: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the text being read aloud, and the teacher leads a discussion guided by a series of text-dependent questions.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Read the first two paragraphs aloud or plays the audio file following the link in the text. (Note that while this recording is the same translation as the text provided, it is not excerpted.) Lead a discussion guided by three text-dependent questions:

1- What is Socrates being accused of?
2- How does Socrates make it clear that he is innocent?
3- How does Socrates distinguish himself from other teachers?

While Plato's central ideas in the text are not extremely difficult, the sentence structure will be challenging for students, especially ELL. A Spanish translation is provided to support students whose first language is Spanish. These students should be encouraged to read from both translations, while using the English one to develop their evidence-based claims.

The close reading of these paragraphs serves three primary purposes: to ensure comprehension of an important part of the text, to orient students to the practice of close reading, and to guide students in searching for textual evidence.

Use the discussion about the questions to help students learn the essential skills of selecting interesting and significant textual details and connecting them inferentially. This process links directly to the forming of evidence-based claims they will begin in Activity Four.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 3: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION (CONT'D)

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

1- What is Socrates being accused of?

Discuss with students how beginning with a statement of his accusation sets a foundation for the purpose and meaning of the text. Socrates begins by giving a summary of the charges against him. He cites an affidavit that accuses him of being 'an evil-doer, and a curious person, who searching into things under the earth and in heaven and he makes the worse appear the better cause; and he teaches these doctrines to others.' At this point in the text, it is unclear what it means to be accused of making the worse better, or why Socrates is being put to trial for his curiosity. There are, however, a few concrete accusations that can be extracted from the affidavit; namely, that Socrates is being charged with unlawfully teaching doctrines that are not acceptable.

2- How does Socrates make it clear that he is innocent?

One of the pleasures and challenges of this text is figuring out Socrates' various purposes with his speech. This can be a recurrent theme for discussion. Bringing students continually back to Socrates' words, track both his expressed purposes and those that are subtly and ironically implied. It is immediately clear, even as Socrates attempts to "begin at the beginning," that these accusations against him are longstanding, and that he intends to strongly refute them. He links the accusations to Aristophanes' comedy. He claims that Aristophanes' portrayal of him and the charges are false. He calls the charges, "slander," and states that "I have nothing to do with the physical speculations." Talk about the importance of the title of the text here. Though the text is titled "The Apology," the Greek word apologia is better translated into English as defense. The text is meant to be Socrates' defense of himself, not his apology for something he admits he has done wrong.

3- How does Socrates distinguish himself from other teachers?

The concrete accusation that we can glean from the text at this point is that Socrates is being accused of being a teacher. He immediately and repeatedly refutes this accusation by distinguishing himself from other teachers in two ways. The first is by claiming that he does not take money for teaching, making the accusation false. The second is by making the statement that it is impossible to be a teacher at all. The statement, "if man were really able to instruct mankind, to receive money for giving instruction would, in my opinion, be an honor to him," suggests that Socrates believes it is impossible to instruct mankind to begin with.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 4: MODEL FORMING EBCs

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Based on the class discussion of the text, the teacher models a critical reading and thinking process for forming EBCs: from comprehension of textual details that stand out, to an inference that arises from examining the details, to a basic EBC that is supported by specific references back to the text.

Once the class has reached an understanding of the text, use the Forming EBC Handout to introduce a three-step process for making a claim that arises from the text.

Exemplify the process by making a claim with the Forming EBC Worksheet. The worksheet is organized so that students first take note of "interesting" details that they also see as "related" to each other. The second section asks them to think about and explain a connection they have made among those details.
Such "text-to-text" connections should be distinguished from "text-to-self" connections readers make between what they have read and their own experiences. These "text-to-text" connections can then lead them to a "claim" they can make and record in the third section of the worksheet – a conclusion they have drawn about the text that can be referenced back to textual details and text-to-text connections. Have students follow along as you talk through the process with your claim.

To provide structured practice for the first two steps, you might give students a textual detail on a blank worksheet. In pairs, have students use the worksheet to find other details/quotations that could be related to the one you have provided, and then make/explain connections among those details. Use the EBC Checklist 1 to discuss the claim, asking students to explain how it meets (or doesn't yet meet) the criteria.

[Note: Here and throughout the entire unit, you are encouraged to develop claims based on your own analysis and class discussion. The provided models are possibilities meant more to illustrate the process than to shape textual analysis. Instruction will be most effective if the claims used in modeling flow naturally from the textual ideas and details you and the students find significant and interesting. Also, while the worksheets have three or four places for supporting evidence, students should know that not all claims require three pieces of evidence. Places on the worksheets can be left blank.]

INDEPENDENT READING ACTIVITY

Students read paragraphs 3-6 and use the Making EBC Worksheet to find evidence to support the teacher-provided claim. This activity overlaps with the first activity of Part 2 and can be given as homework or done at the beginning of the next class.

ASSESSMENT OPPORTUNITIES

The Forming EBC Worksheet should be evaluated to get an initial assessment of students' grasp of the relationship between claims and textual evidence. Even though the work was done together with the class, filling in the worksheet helps them get a sense of the critical reading and thinking process and the relationships among the ideas. Also make sure that students are developing the habit of using quotation marks and recording the reference.

CC BY-NC

PART 2

MAKING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

"I neither know nor think that I know."

OBJECTIVE:	Students develop the ability to make evidence-based claims through a close reading of the text.

ESTIMATED TIME: 1-3 days

MATERIALS:
Making EBC Worksheet
Forming EBC Handout
Forming EBC Worksheet
EBC Criteria Checklist I
TCD Checklist

ACTIVITIES

1- INDEPENDENT READING AND FINDING SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
Students independently read part of the text and use the Making EBC Worksheet to look for evidence to support a claim made by the teacher.

2- READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION
Students follow along as they listen to the same part of the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.

3- FIND SUPPORTING EVIDENCE IN PAIRS
In pairs, students use the Making EBC Worksheet to look for evidence to support additional claims about the text made by the teacher.

4- CLASS DISCUSSION OF EBCs
The class discusses evidence in support of claims found by student pairs.

5- FORMING EBCs IN PAIRS
In pairs, students use the Forming EBC Worksheet to make an evidence-based claim of their own and present it to the class.

ALIGNMENT TO CCSS

TARGETED STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.1
RI.9-10.1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

SUPPORTING STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.2 RI.9-10.3 SL.9-10.1
RI.9-10.2: Determine a central idea of a text and analyze its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.
RI.9-10.3: Analyze how the author unfolds an analysis or series of ideas or events, including the order in which the points are made, how they are introduced and developed, and the connections that are drawn between them.
SL.9-10.1: Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9-10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 1: INDEPENDENT READING AND FINDING SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

Students independently read part of the text and use the Making EBC Worksheet to look for evidence to support a claim made by the teacher.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Students independently work on paragraphs 3-6 of Plato's "Apology". Depending on scheduling and student ability, students can be assigned to read and complete the worksheet for homework. Teachers should decide what works best for their students. It's essential that students have opportunity to read the text independently. All students must develop the habit of perseverance in reading. Assigning the reading as homework potentially gives them more time with the text. Either way, it might be a good idea to provide some time at the beginning of class for students to read the section quietly by themselves. This ensures that all students have had at least some independent reading time.

Also depending on scheduling and student ability, some students might choose (or be encouraged) to read ahead. Instructional focus should follow the pacing outlined in the activities, but students will only benefit from reading and re-reading the text throughout the duration of the unit.

ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the same part of the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Students follow along as they listen to paragraphs 3-6 of the text being read aloud and discuss three text-dependent questions:

1- What does the oracle say about Socrates?

2- What does Socrates do in an attempt to test the truth of the oracle's prophesy?

3- Why do Socrates' actions incite the anger of his peers?

Read the text aloud to the class while students follow along. Alternatively, students could be asked to read aloud to the class. Work through the text using the following three text-dependent questions.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION (CONT'D)

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

1- What does the oracle say about Socrates?

Socrates explains that a close friend of his, Chaerephon, went to the oracle and asked if there was anyone wiser than Socrates. The oracle answered that there is no one wiser than Socrates. When Chaerephon relayed this to Socrates, Socrates was shocked. "What can the god mean?" Socrates asked. Convinced of his own ignorance, but equally convinced of the infallibility of the oracle, Socrates concluded that the statement must be a riddle. "What is the interpretation of his riddle?" Socrates wondered. Emphasize that in ancient Greece, the oracle was thought to be a portal through which the gods spoke directly to people. The statements of the oracle were understood to be the word of god, and therefore never doubted. "He is a god, and cannot lie; that would be against his nature," Socrates reasons. If a statement was confusing or seemed incorrect, it was assumed to be a riddle. Therefore, when Socrates heard the oracle's statement that he was the wisest man in Greece,he took it as his life's calling to figure out the truth behind that statement.

2- What does Socrates do in an attempt to test the truth of the oracle's prophesy?

Socrates set out to test the wisdom of his fellow citizens through a method of interrogation that we now refer to as the Socratic method. "After long consideration, I thought of a method of trying the question. I reflected that if I could only find a man wiser than myself, then I might go to the god with a refutation in my hand." Socrates sought out Athenian citizens who were typically thought of as wise men. When he began to question their wisdom, Socrates found that they were not actually wise. Further, they were incapable of admitting their ignorance and became angered when Socrates exposed it. Socrates comes to the conclusion that the wisdom he has lies in his ability to admit what he does not know, which no one else seems willing to do. "I neither know nor think that I know." This idea is a central theme of the text, and is worth emphasizing. To that end, it might be beneficial to discuss the inferences that we must draw when we read the text in order to understand it. Even when Socrates is giving a straightforward report of the events, the text requires the reader engage with it and draw meaning from it .

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION (CONT'D)

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

3- Why do Socrates' actions incite the anger of his peers?

Socrates' attempt to discover the truth of the claim that there is no one wiser than he involves exposing his peers to be unwise. Not only did Socrates expose the ignorance of his peers but he did so in public. Further, Socrates makes it clear that he exposed many Athenian citizens as ignorant who had been previously thought of as wise. As he was doing this, Socrates was aware of the fact that his peers were angry with him, but he felt that he was responsible for attempting to understand the oracle's prophesy. Help students trace the connection from the oracle's proclamation to Socrates' "testing" to the angering of powerful "wise" Athenians to the accusations to his current situation .

ACTIVITY 3: FIND SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

In pairs, students use the Making EBC Worksheet to look for evidence to support additional claims about the text made by the teacher.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Once the class has reached a solid understanding of the text, connect it to the skill of making claims and supporting them with evidence by presenting a few main claims. Pass out the worksheets and have students work in pairs to find evidence to support the claims.

Collect each student's Making EBC Worksheet with the evidence they found for the first claim. These should be evaluated to get an assessment of where each student is in the skill development. Students should use their worksheets for their work in pairs—repeating the first claim and refining their evidence based on the read aloud and class discussion. Even though students are not finding the evidence independently, they should each fill in the worksheets to reinforce their acquisition of the logical structure among the ideas. Students should get into the habit of using quotation marks when recording direct quotes and including the line numbers of the evidence.

The instructional focus here is developing familiarity with claims about texts and the use of textual evidence to support them. Students should still not be expected to develop complete sentences to express supporting evidence. The pieces of evidence should be as focused as possible. The idea is for students to identify the precise points in the text that support the claim. This focus is lost if the pieces of evidence become too large. The worksheets are constructed to elicit a type of "pointing" at the evidence.

One approach for ensuring a close examination of claims and evidence is to provide erroneous claims that contradict textual evidence and ask students to find the places that disprove the claim. Students could then be asked to modify it to account for the evidence.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 4: CLASS DISCUSSION OF EBCs

The class discusses evidence in support of claims found by student pairs.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

After students have finished their work in pairs, regroup for a class discussion. Have pairs volunteer to present their evidence to the rest of the class. Discuss the evidence, evaluating how each piece supports the claims. Begin by modeling the evaluation, referring to the checklist, and then call on students to evaluate the evidence shared by the other pairs.
They can offer their own evidence to expand the discussion. Carefully guide the exchanges, explicitly asking students to support their evaluations with reference to the text.
These constructive discussions are essential for the skill development. Listening to and evaluating the evidence of others and providing text-based criticism expands students' capacity to reason through the relationship between claims and evidence. Paying close attention to and providing instructional guidance on the student comments is as important to the process as evaluating the worksheets and creates a class culture of supporting all claims (including oral critiques) with evidence.

Using the Text-Centered Discussion Checklist is one way of talking about and supporting student participation in class and pair discussions, especially if students are already familiar with the TCD checklist from previous units. If not, time can be taken (if desired) to introduce them to some or all of the criteria of effective text-centered discussions.

ACTIVITY 5: FORMING EBCs IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Forming EBC Worksheet to make an evidence-based claim of their own and present it to the class.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Once the claims and evidence have been discussed, students return to the pairs and use the worksheet to make an evidence-based claim of their own. Pairs should make a single claim, but each student should fill in his or her own worksheet. Regroup and discuss the claims and evidence as a class. Pairs can use their worksheet to present their claims and evidence orally.

Talk through the process modeled in the worksheet, including the nature of the details that stood out to students, the reasoning they used to group and relate them, and the claim they developed from the textual evidence. Draw upon the Forming EBC Handout and EBC Criteria Checklist I to help guide discussion.

CC BY-NC

INDEPENDENT READING ACTIVITY

Students read paragraphs 7-11 of Plato's "Apology" and use the Forming EBC Worksheet to make a claim and support it with evidence. This activity overlaps with the first activity of Part 3 and can be given as homework or done at the beginning of the next class.

ASSESSMENT OPPORTUNITIES

The Making EBC Worksheets should be evaluated to assess the development of the student's grasp of the relationship between claims and textual evidence. They should show progress in the relevance and focus of the evidence. The Forming EBC Worksheets are students' first attempts at making their own claims with the help of a peer. Basic claims are fine at this point. Use the EBC Criteria Checklist to structure the evaluation and feedback to students. Evaluation should focus on the validity and clarity of the claim and the relevance of the evidence. Recording the "thinking" part of the worksheet is important in order to strengthen the student's reasoning skills as well as provide them with the academic vocabulary to talk about them.

Evidence should be in quotation marks and the reference recorded. Using quotation marks helps students make the distinction between quotes and paraphrases. It also helps them to eventually incorporate quotes properly into their writing. Recording references is critical not only for proper incorporation in writing, but also because it helps students return to text for re-evaluating evidence and making appropriate selections.

The Text-Centered Discussion Checklist can be used to evaluate student participation in discussions for formative and diagnostic information. Teachers and students can get a sense of areas where development in speaking and listening skills are needed.

CC BY-NC

PART 3

ORGANIZING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

"A Sort of Gadfly"

OBJECTIVE:	Students expand their ability into organizing evidence to develop and explain claims through a close reading of the text.

ESTIMATED TIME: 1-3 days

MATERIALS:
Organizing EBC Worksheet
Forming EBC Worksheet
EBC Criteria Checklist I

ACTIVITIES

1- INDEPENDENT READING AND FORMING EBCs
Students independently read part of the text and use the Forming EBC Worksheet to make an evidence-based claim.

2- READ ALOUD
Students follow along as they listen to part of the text being read aloud.

3- MODEL ORGANIZING EBCs
The teacher models organizing evidence to develop and explain claims using student evidence-based claims and the Organizing EBC Worksheet.

4- ORGANIZING EBCs IN PAIRS
In pairs, students develop a claim with multiple points using the Organizing EBC Worksheet.

5- CLASS DISCUSSION OF STUDENT EBCs
The class discusses the evidence-based claims developed by student pairs.

ALIGNMENT TO CCSS

TARGETED STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.1
RI.9-10.1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

SUPPORTING STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.2 RI.9-10.3 SL.9-10.1
RI.9-10.2: Determine a central idea of a text and analyze its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.
RI.9-10.3: Analyze how the author unfolds an analysis or series of ideas or events, including the order in which the points are made, how they are introduced and developed, and the connections that are drawn between them.
SL.9-10.1: Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9-10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 1: INDEPENDENT READING AND FORMING EBCs

Students independently read part of the text and use the Forming EBC Worksheet to make an evidence-based claim.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Students independently work on paragraphs 7-11 of Plato's "Apology". Depending on scheduling and student ability, students can be assigned to read and complete the worksheet for homework. Teachers should decide what works best for their students. It's essential that students have an opportunity to read the text independently. All students must develop the habit of perseverance in reading. Assigning the reading as homework potentially gives them more time with the text. Either way, it might be a good idea to provide some time at the beginning of class for students to read quietly by themselves. This ensures that all students have had least some independent reading time.

ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD

Students follow along as they listen to part of the text being read aloud.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Read paragraphs 7-11 aloud to the class while students follow along. Alternatively, students could be asked to read aloud to the class.

ACTIVITY 3: MODEL ORGANIZING EBCs

The teacher models organizing evidence to develop and explain claims using student evidence-based claims and the Organizing EBC Worksheet.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

The central focus of Part 3 is learning the thinking processes associated with developing an evidence-based claim: reflecting on how one has arrived at the claim; breaking the claim into parts; organizing supporting evidence in a logical sequence; anticipating what an audience will need to know in order to understand the claim; and, eventually, planning a line of reasoning that will substantiate the claim. This is a complex set of cognitive skills, challenging for most students , but essential so that students can move from the close reading process of arriving at a claim (Parts 1-2 of the unit) to the purposeful writing process of explaining and substantiating that claim (Parts 4-5).

How a reader develops and organizes a claim is dependent upon the nature of the claim itself – and the nature of the text (or texts) from which it arises. In some cases – simple claims involving literal interpretation of the text – indicating

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 3: MODEL ORGANIZING EBCs (CONT'D)

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

where the claim comes from in the text and explaining how the reader arrived at it is sufficient. This suggests a more straightforward, explanatory organization. More complex claims, however, often involve multiple parts, points, or premises, each of which needs to be explained and developed, then linked in a logical order into a coherent development.

Students only learn how to develop and organize a claim through practice, ideally moving over time from simpler claims and more familiar organizational patterns to more complex claims and organizations.

Students can be helped in learning how to develop a claim by using a set of developmental guiding questions such as the following: [Note: the first few questions might be used with younger or less experiences readers, the latter questions with students who are developing more sophisticated claims.]

- What do I mean when I state this claim? What am I trying to communicate?
- How did I arrive at this claim? Can I "tell the story" of how I moved as a reader from the literal details of the text to a supported claim about the text?
- Can I point to the specific words and sentences in the text from which the claim arises?
- What do I need to explain so that an audience can understand what I mean and where my claim comes from?
- What evidence (quotations) might I use to illustrate my claim? In what order?
- If my claim contains several parts (or premises), how can I break it down, organize the parts, and organize the evidence that goes with them?
- If my claim involves a comparison or a relationship, how might I present, clarify, and organize my discussion of the relationship between parts or texts?

Students who are learning how to develop a claim, at any level, can benefit from graphic organizers or instructional scaffolding that helps them work out, organize, and record their thinking. While such models or templates should not be presented formulaically as a "how to" for developing a claim, they can be used to support the learning process. The Organizing EBC Worksheet can be used to provide some structure for student planning – or you can substitute another model or graphic organizer that fits well with the text , the types of claims being developed, and the needs of the students.

Begin by orienting students to the new worksheet and the idea of breaking down a claim into parts and organizing the evidence accordingly.

Ask for a volunteer to present his or her claim and supporting evidence. Use the example as a basis for a discussion. Based on the flow of discussion, bring in other volunteers to present their claims and evidence to build and help clarify the points. Work with students to hone and develop a claim. As a class, express the organized claim in Organizing EBC Worksheet The provided teacher version is one possible way a claim could be expressed and organized.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 4: ORGANIZING EBCs IN PAIRS

In pairs, students develop and organize a claim using the Organizing EBC Worksheet.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

When the class has reached a solid expression of an organized evidence-based claim, have students work in pairs, using the worksheet to develop and organize another claim.

You might want to give students some general guidance by directing their focus to a specific section of the text.

ACTIVITY 5: CLASS DISCUSSION OF STUDENT EBCs

After students have finished their work in pairs, regroup for a class discussion about their EBCs.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Have pairs volunteer to present their claims and evidence to the rest of the class. Discuss the evidence and organization, evaluating how each piece supports and develops the claims. Repeat the process from activity two, using student work to explain how evidence is organized to develop aspects of claims. The teacher version of the Organizing EBC Worksheet is one possible way a claim could be expressed and organized.

INDEPENDENT READING ACTIVITY

Students review the text and use the Forming EBC Worksheet to make any claim and support it with evidence. This activity overlaps with the first activity of Part 4 and can be given as homework or done at the beginning of the next class.

ASSESSMENT OPPORTUNITIES

Students are now beginning to develop more complex claims about challenging portions of the text. Their Forming EBC Worksheet should demonstrate a solid grasp of the claim-evidence relationship, but do not expect precision in the wording of their claims. Using the Organizing EBC Worksheet will help them clarify their claims as they break it into parts and organize their evidence. How they have transferred their information will demonstrate their grasp of the concept of organizing. Their second Organizing EBC Worksheet should show progress in all dimensions including the clarity of the claim and the selection and organization of evidence. Use the EBC criteria checklist to structure the evaluation and feedback to students.

CC BY-NC

PART 4

WRITING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

"The Faster Runner"

OBJECTIVE:	Students develop the ability to express evidence-based claims in writing through a close reading of the text.

ESTIMATED TIME: 1-3 days

MATERIALS:
Writing EBC Handout
Forming EBC Worksheet
Organizing EBC Worksheet
EBC Criteria Checklist II
TCD Checklist

ACTIVITIES

1- INDEPENDENT READING AND MAKING EBCs
Students independently review the text and use the Forming EBC Worksheet to develop an evidence-based claim.

2- MODEL WRITING EBCs
The teacher introduces and models writing evidence-based claims using a claim developed in Part 3.

3- WRITING EBCs IN PAIRS
In pairs, students write evidence-based claims using one of their claims from Part 3.

4- CLASS DISCUSSION OF WRITTEN EBCs
The class discusses the written evidence-based claims of volunteer student pairs.

5- READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION
The class discusses their new evidence-based claims and students read aloud portions of the text.

6- INDEPENDENT WRITING OF EBCs
Students independently write their new evidence-based claims.

ALIGNMENT TO CCSS

TARGETED STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.1 W.9-10.9b
RI.9-10.1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.
W.9-10.9b: Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.

SUPPORTING STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.2 RI.9-10.3 SL.9-10.1
RI.9-10.2: Determine a central idea of a text and analyze its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.
RI.9-10.3: Analyze how the author unfolds an analysis or series of ideas or events, including the order in which the points are made, how they are introduced and developed, and the connections that are drawn between them.
SL.9-10.1: Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9-10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 1: INDEPENDENT READING AND MAKING EBCs

Students independently review the text and use the Forming EBC Worksheet to develop an evidence-based claim.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Depending on scheduling and student ability, students can be assigned to read and complete the worksheet for homework. Teachers should decide what works best for their students. It's essential that students have an opportunity to read the text independently. All students must develop the habit of perseverance in reading.

Assigning the reading as homework potentially gives them more time with the text. Either way, it might be a good idea to provide some time at the beginning of class for students to read the text quietly by themselves. This ensures that all students have had at least some independent reading time.

ACTIVITY 2: MODEL WRITING EBCs

The teacher introduces and models writing evidence-based claims using a claim developed in Part 3.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Parts 1-3 have built a solid foundation of critical thinking and reading skills for developing and organizing evidence-based claims. Parts 4 and 5 focus on expressing evidence-based claims in writing. Class discussions and pair work have given students significant practice expressing and defending their claims orally. The worksheets have given them practice selecting and organizing evidence. Expressing evidence-based claims in writing should now be a natural transition from this foundation.

Begin by explaining that expressing evidence-based claims in writing follows the same basic structure that they have been using with the worksheets; one states a claim and develops it with evidence. Discuss the additional considerations when writing evidence-based claims like establishing a clear context and using proper techniques for incorporating textual evidence. Introduce the EBC Criteria Checklist II with the additional writing-related criteria The Writing EBC Handout gives one approach to explaining writing evidence-based claims. Model example written evidence-based claims are provided with the materials.

Explain that the simplest structure for writing evidence-based claims is beginning with a paragraph stating the claim and its context and then using subsequent paragraphs logically linked together to develop the necessary points of the claim with appropriate evidence. (More advanced writers can organize the expression differently, like establishing a context, building points with evidence, and stating the claim at the end for a more dramatic effect. It's good to let students know that the simplest structure is not the only effective way).

Incorporating textual evidence into writing is difficult and takes practice. Expect all students to need a lot of guidance deciding on what precise evidence to use, how to order it, and deciding when to paraphrase or to quote. They will also need guidance structuring sentence syntax and grammar to smoothly and effectively incorporate textual details, while maintaining their own voice and style.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 2: MODEL WRITING EBCs (CONT'D)

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Three things to consider when teaching this difficult skill:

- A "think-aloud" approach can be extremely effective here. When modeling the writing process, explain the choices you make. For example, "I'm paraphrasing this piece of evidence because it takes the author four sentences to express what I can do in one." Or, "I'm quoting this piece directly because the author's phrase is so powerful, I want to use the original words."
- Making choices when writing evidence-based claims is easiest when the writer has "lived with the claims." Thinking about a claim—personalizing the analysis—gives a writer an intuitive sense of how she wants to express it. Spending time with the worksheets selecting and organizing evidence will start students on this process.
- Students need to know that this is a process—that it can't be done in one draft. Revision is fundamental to honing written evidence-based claims.

ACTIVITY 3: WRITING EBCs IN PAIRS

In pairs, students write evidence-based claims using their claims from Part 3.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Students return to the same pairs they had in Part 3 and use their Organizing EBC Worksheets as guidelines for their writing. Teachers should roam, supporting pairs by answering questions and helping them get comfortable with the techniques for incorporating evidence. Use questions from pairs as opportunities to instruct the entire class.

ACTIVITY 4: CLASS DISCUSSION OF WRITTEN EBCs

The class discusses the written evidence-based claims of volunteer student pairs.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Have a pair volunteer to write their evidence-based claim on the board. The class together should evaluate the way the writing sets the context, expresses the claim, effectively organizes the evidence, and incorporates the evidence properly. Use the EBC Criteria Checklist II to guide evaluation. The Text-Centered Discussion Checklist (if being used) is helpful here to guide effective participation in discussion. Of course, it's also a good opportunity to talk about grammatical structure and word choice. Let other students lead the evaluation, reserving guidance when needed and appropriate. It is likely and ideal that other students will draw on their own versions in when evaluating the volunteer pair's. Make sure that class discussion maintains a constructive collegial tone and all critiques are backed with evidence.

Model written evidence-based claims are provided in the materials.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 5: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION

The class discusses their new evidence-based claims from Activity 1 and students read aloud portions of the text.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

At this stage, this activity is reversed from earlier similar ones. Students should present their evidence-based claims and allow discussion to determine areas of the text to be read aloud. Students read aloud relevant portions to help the class analyze claims and selected evidence. Have students transfer their claims from the Forming EBC Worksheet to the Organizing EBC Worksheet to help them organize and refine their evidence in preparation for writing.

ACTIVITY 6: INDEPENDENT WRITING OF EBCs

Students independently write their evidence-based claims from their Organizing EBC Worksheets.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Students should have refined their claims and developed an Organizing EBC Worksheet based on class discussion. Now they independently write their claims based on their worksheets.

INDEPENDENT READING ACTIVITY

Students review the entire text and use an Organizing EBC Worksheet to make a new claim of their choice and develop it with evidence. This activity overlaps with the first activity of Part 5 and can be given as homework or done at the beginning of the next class.

ASSESSMENT OPPORTUNITIES

At this stage teachers can assess students' reading and writing skills. Students should be comfortable making claims and supporting them with organized evidence. Their worksheets should demonstrate evidence of mastery of the reading skill. Student writing should demonstrate the same qualities of organization. Make sure they have properly established the context; that the claim is clearly expressed; and that each paragraph develops a coherent point. Evaluate the writing for an understanding of the difference between paraphrase and quotation. All evidence should be properly referenced. Use the EBC Criteria Checklist II to structure the evaluation and feedback to students.

CC BY-NC

PART 5

DEVELOPING EVIDENCE-BASED WRITING

"The Hour of Departure"

OBJECTIVE:	Students develop the ability to express global evidence-based claims in writing through a close reading of the text.

ESTIMATED TIME: 1-2 days

MATERIALS:
Organizing EBC Worksheet
Writing EBC Handout
EBC Criteria Checklist II
Evidence-Based Writing Rubric

ACTIVITIES

1- INDEPENDENT READING AND MAKING EBCs
Students independently review the entire text and use the Organizing EBC Worksheet to make a new evidence-based claim.

2- CLASS DISCUSSION OF GLOBAL EBCs
The teacher analyzes volunteer students' written evidence-based claims from Part 4 and discusses developing global EBCs.

3- PAIRS DISCUSS THEIR EBCs
Students discuss their new claims in pairs and then with the class.

4- INDEPENDENT WRITING OF FINAL PIECE
Students independently write a final evidence-based writing piece using their new claims.

5- CLASS DISCUSSION OF FINAL WRITING PIECES
The class discusses final evidence-based writing pieces of student volunteers.

ALIGNMENT TO CCSS

TARGETED STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.1 W.9-10.9b
RI.9-10.1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.
W.9-10.9b: Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.

SUPPORTING STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.2 RI.9-10.3 SL.9-10.1 W.9-10.4
RI.9-10.2: Determine a central idea of a text and analyze its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.
RI.9-10.3: Analyze how the author unfolds an analysis or series of ideas or events, including the order in which the points are made, how they are introduced and developed, and the connections that are drawn between them.
SL.9-10.1: Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9-10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.
W.9-10.4: Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 1: INDEPENDENT READING AND MAKING EBCs

Students independently review the entire text and use the Organizing EBC Worksheet to make a new evidence-based claim.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Depending on scheduling and student ability, students can be assigned to read and complete the worksheet for homework. Teachers should decide what works best for their students. It's essential that students have an opportunity to read the text independently. All students must develop the habit of perseverance in reading.

Assigning the reading as homework potentially gives them more time with the text. Either way, it might be a good idea to provide some time at the beginning of class for students to read the text quietly by themselves. This ensures that all students have had at least some independent reading time.

ACTIVITY 2: CLASS DISCUSSION OF GLOBAL EBCs

The teacher analyzes volunteer students' written evidence-based claims from Part 4 and discusses developing global EBCs.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

This activity should be seen as an expansion of the skills developed in Part 4. Begin by analyzing volunteer student-written claims to review the critical aspects of writing. These claims will vary in the amount of text they span and the global nature of the ideas. Use various examples to demonstrate the differences, moving to a discussion of how claims build on each other to produce more global analysis of entire texts.

Throughout the unit the text has been chunked into gradually larger sections, and now students have been asked to consider the entire text for their final claim. Model making a more global claim, discussing its relationship to smaller local claims. Demonstrate how claims can become sub-points for other claims.

Some students can be asked to present the claims they have developed as further models. The Writing EBC Handout could aid discussion on how various claims require various ways of establishing their context and relevance.

CC BY-NC

ACTIVITY 3: PAIRS DISCUSS THEIR EBCs

Students discuss their new claims from Activity 1 in pairs and then with the class.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Once the class has a general understanding of the nature of more global claims, break them into pairs to work on the claims they have begun to develop in Activity 1. Have the pairs discuss if their claims contain sub-claims and how best they would be organized. It may be helpful to provide students with both the two-point and three-point organizational worksheets to best fit their claims.

Volunteer pairs should be asked to discuss the work they did on their claims. At this point they should be able to talk about the nature of their claims and why they have chosen to organize evidence in particular ways.

ACTIVITY 4: INDEPENDENT WRITING OF FINAL PIECE

Students independently write a final evidence-based writing piece using their new claims.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

This evidence-based writing piece should be used as a summative assessment to evaluate acquisition of the reading and writing skills. Evaluating the claims and discussing ways of improving their organization breaks the summative assessment into two parts: making an evidence-based claim, and writing an evidence-based claim.

ACTIVITY 5: CLASS DISCUSSION OF FINAL WRITING PIECES

The class discusses the final evidence-based writing piece of student volunteers. If the Text-Centered Discussion Checklist has been used throughout the unit, this activity can be used for formative assessment on student discussion skills. In this case, the activity can be structured more formally, either as small group discussions where each student reads, receives constructive evidence-based feedback from other group members, and then responds orally with possible modifications.

CC BY-NC

ASSESSMENT

At this stage teachers can assess students' reading and writing skills. Students should be comfortable making claims and supporting them with organized evidence. Their worksheets should demonstrate mastery of the reading skill. Their final evidence-based writing piece can be seen as a summative assessment of both the reading and writing skills. Use the Evidence-Based Writing Rubric to evaluate their pieces.

If activity 5 is used for assessment of discussion skills, use the Text-Centered Discussion Checklist to structure evaluation and feedback.

ALTERNATIVE ORGANIZATION OF PART 5

The activities of Part 5 can be re-ordered to provide a slightly different summative assessment. Teachers could choose not to give Activity 1 as an initial homework assignment or begin the part with it. Instead they can begin with the analysis of student writing from Part 4 and the discussion of global claims. Then students can be assigned to review the entire speech, use a worksheet to make a global evidence-based claim ,and move directly to developing the final evidence-based writing piece. This configuration of the activities provides a complete integrated reading and writing assessment. Depending on scheduling, this activity could be done in class or given partially or entirely as a homework assignment. Even with this configuration, ELL students or those reading below grade level can be supported by having their claims evaluated before they begin writing their pieces.

ACTIVITY 1- CLASS DISCUSSION OF GLOBAL EBCs
The teacher analyzes volunteer students' written evidence-based claims from Part 4 and discusses developing global claims.

ACTIVITY 2- INDEPENDENT READING AND MAKING EBCs
Students review the entire text and use an Organizing EBC Worksheet to make a global EBC.

ACTIVITY 3- INDEPENDENT WRITING OF FINAL PIECE
Students independently write a final evidence-based writing piece using their global claims.

ACTIVITY 4- CLASS DISCUSSION OF FINAL WRITING PIECES
The class discusses final evidence-based writing pieces of student volunteers.

CC BY-NC